

Short-Duration Intensive Training Program in Public Health Ethics

Organized by

Health, Ethics and Law ([HEaL](#)) Institute for Training, Research and Advocacy of
Forum for Medical Ethics Society ([FMES](#)), Mumbai

in collaboration with

ICMR-National Institute of Epidemiology ([ICMR-NIE](#)), Chennai, TN, India;
[Centre for Public Health](#), School of Health Systems Studies,
Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai, MH, India; and
Centre for Policy Studies ([CPS](#)), Indian Institute of Technology Bombay, Mumbai, India
Vidhayak Trust, Pune

Days & Dates: All Saturdays including and between October 1, 2022 and November 26, 2022
Time: 1600-1930 hours (Indian Standard Time)

Venue: Virtual

About the course: The field of public health ethics is an emerging area within the broader discipline of bioethics. It has taken shape as a niche area over about the past decade and a half.

We have developed public health ethics case studies from the Indian context and these are complemented by those from other contexts relevant to the course content. These serve as one of the key resources for the course.

The course aims to equip course participants with knowledge and skills in public health ethics. They would serve as significant human resource to take the learnings to their own ecosystems and facilitate knowledge transfer in public health ethics in their organization and peer networks.

Goal: This training is aimed at enabling public health students and researchers; and public health practitioners to apply public health ethics frameworks and principles to reason out new, difficult, or ambiguous cases/situations/scenarios towards resolving the issue at hand in morally discerning ways.

Specific learning objectives

- a. To understand the concepts of public, health, public health, and public health ethics and their distinctive features as opposed to clinical ethics.
- b. To learn the ethics principles and ethics theories in the context of public health ethics;
- c. To learn to identify, articulate, and analyze ethical issues arising from public health, and to formulate critical and well-reasoned ethical arguments
- d. To develop competence to participate in ethical decision-making as issues arise in public health practice, policy formulation, surveillance, and research.
- e. To know the existing national and international regulatory and public health governance framework/s, laws; and ethics guidance on public health ethics

Learning methods

- a. Interactive methods using case studies sourced and developed from within India to be complemented by those from outside of India.
- b. Interactive presentations by faculty using case examples embedded in presentations

Faculty

1. Dr Angus Dawson, Professor of Bioethics and Director of Sydney Health Ethics, University of Sydney, Sydney, Australia
2. Dr Amar Jesani, MBBS, Independent Researchers and Consultant, Public Health and Bioethics, Mumbai; and Editor, *Indian Journal of Medical Ethics (IJME)*, Mumbai, MH, India;
3. Dr Anant Bhan, Sangath Bhopal, Bhopal, MP, India; Adjunct Professor, Yenepoya (deemed to be University), Mangalore, India
4. Dr Calvin Ho, Professor with the Faculty of Law, and Co-Director, Centre for Medical Ethics, University of Hong Kong
5. Dr Jagdish Patel, Founder, Peoples Training & Research Center, Baroda, GJ, India
6. Dr James Dwyer, Professor, Upstate Medical University, NY, USA
7. Dr Kaustubh Joag, Senior Research Fellow & Consultant Psychiatrist, Centre for Mental Health, Policy and Law (CMHLP), ILS Society, Pune
8. Dr P Manickam, Scientist F, ICMR-National Institute of Epidemiology (ICMR-NIE), Chennai, TN, India
9. Dr Nilesh Gawde, Professor, Centre for Public Health, School of Health Systems Studies, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai, MH, India
10. Dr E Premdas Pinto, Professor of public health and human rights law in the Azim Premji University, Bangalore, India
11. Dr Srijit Mishra, Professor, India Gandhi Institute for Development Research (IGIDR), Mumbai
12. Dr Subha Sri Balakrishnan, Independent Women and Human Rights activist; associated with Rural Women's Social Education Centre, Chengalpattu District, Tamilnadu, India
13. Dr Sunita Sheel Bandewar, Director, FMES' Health, Ethics and Law Institute of Training, Research and Advocacy, Mumbai-Pune; Working Editor, IJME; Gen Sec, FMES; Founding Trustee, Vidhayak Trust;
14. Dr Tarun Bhatnagar, Scientist F, ICMR-National Institute of Epidemiology (ICMR-NIE), Chennai, TN, India
15. Dr Vijay Gopichandran, Professor, Department of Community Medicine, ESIC Medical College, Chennai, TN, India

**Short-Duration Intensive Training Program in
Public Health Ethics**

Saturdays including and during the period between October, 2022 and Nov 26, 2022

Time: 1600 – 1930 hrs (Indian Standard Times)

Mode: Virtual

Program Schedule

DAY 1 Saturday, Oct 1, 2022			
Unit 1 Public health and public health ethics			
Hours & Session no	Topic	Faculty	Learning Objectives
1530-1600	Welcome and Introduction	Representative of co-hosts and all course participants	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Course overview and ➤ Introduction to course objectives and learning methods, resources, and faculty
Session 1 1600 – 1730	From the ground zero: Knowing the complexities of public health ethics discourse using case studies	Sunita Sheel and Angus Dawson	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ A brief introduction to the purpose of case studies ➤ Discussing 3 case studies with course participants highlighting deeper relationships between public health and broader determinants of public health towards appreciating the salience of public health ethics discourse
1730-1745	Break		
Session 2 1745-1930	Foundations of public health and epidemiology, relationship amongst them	Manickam P and Tarun Bhatnagar	<p>Manickam P</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn the concept of public health, epidemiology, and diseases of public health importance ➤ To recognize the distinct features of public health and population health as opposed to individual health <p>Tarun Bhatnagar</p> <p>Short film screening</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To situate social epidemiology approach within the principles of public health practice ➤ To understand the possibilities of SE approach - staging social determinant of health ➤ To recognize the need to respond to the societal context of public health problems in India ➤ To learn the concept of vulnerability in the context of public health discourse
End of the Day 1, October 1, 2022			

(...contd) Unit 1| Public health and public health ethics

Session 3 1600-1645	Foundations of public health ethics, key public health ethics principles, values, and Public Health Ethics Frameworks – Part I	Vijay Gopichandran	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn public health ethics from historical perspective ➤ To learn the principles of right to health, social justice and health equity; and the values of solidarity, reciprocity, community, trust and sustainability etc ➤ To learn the concept of public health ethics, ‘common good’, and ‘public good’ To identify the relationship between human rights, public health, public health ethics and law
Session 4 1645 -1730	Foundations of public health ethics, key public health ethics principles and Public Health Ethics Frameworks – Part II	Vijay Gopichandran	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To know select relevant ethics theories (agent-centred, deontology, utilitarianism, communitarianism, liberalism, libertarianism, libertarian paternalism) ➤ To recognize the sources of public health ethics (global conventions, Indian constitutional framework in relations to public health obligations of the state and rights of citizens ➤ To learn about the select public health ethics frameworks to respond to public health issues and situations
1730-1745	Break		
Session 4 (...continued) 1745 - 1830	Foundations of public health ethics, key public health ethics principles and Public Health Ethics Frameworks – Part II	Vijay Gopichandran	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To know select relevant ethics theories (agent-centred, deontology, utilitarianism, communitarianism, liberalism, libertarianism, libertarian paternalism) ➤ To recognize the sources of public health ethics (global conventions, Indian constitutional framework in relations to public health obligations of the state and rights of citizens
Session 5 1830-1930	Project work time		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To form small groups comprising of course participants for working on developing projects in public health and developing response employing the learnings from the course ➤ To help groups to identify their own project theme with the help of faculty

End of the Day 2, October 8, 2022

Unit 2 | Screening and surveillance in Public Health

Hours & Session no	Topic	Faculty	Learning Objectives
1530-1600	RECAP of Day 1 &2 Resolving Queries		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Two course participants to volunteer to recap ➤ Faculty to respond to any questions on the previous day
Session 6 1600-1730	Ethics of disease screening and public health surveillance (PHS)	Nilesh Gawde	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To recognize the distinction between public health research and non-research activities such as public health surveillance, emergency response, PHS and research; ➤ To identify ethical issues in public health surveillance; ➤ To know WHO Guidelines and the four core ethical principles applicable to PHS (the common good, as in shared benefits, but understood in a broader sense than the more narrowly economic term 'public good'; equity, to create just and fair conditions for human flourishing; respect for persons, in order to make protection possible and to minimize the risk of harm; and good governance, promoting accountability and openness to public scrutiny) <p>Case studies embedded in the session Small group work to discuss case studies</p>

1730-1745 **Break**

Unit 3 | UHC, health policies, and ethical imperative

Session 7 1745-1930 Session 7 (a) 1745-1815	Health care system law, and ethics	E Premdas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn the relationship between complex relationships between law and ethics with reference to health care system ➤ To understand the ethical principles that intersect healthcare jurisprudence
Session 7 (b) 1820-1930	Ethics and health policies and UHC as an ethical imperative	Calvin Ho, Hong Kong University	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn to apply public health ethics lens to critically review health policies and programs. ➤ To learn select frameworks of critical policy analysis that exist in public policy analysis ➤ To use the above frameworks to critically appraise National Health Policies of India from a public health ethics perspective <p>Cases studies and ethical analysis of key programs in India</p>

End of the Day 3, October 15, 2022

DAY 4 | Saturday, October 22, 2022

Unit 4: Ethical issues in communicable diseases

Hours & Session no	Topic	Faculty	Learning Objectives
1530-1600	RECAP of Day 2 & 3 Responding to queries		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Two course participants to volunteer to recap ➤ Faculty to respond to any questions on the previous day
Session 8 1600 - 1730	Ethical issues in communicable diseases and programs	Sunita Sheel and Angus Dawson	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn about ethical issues surrounding public health policy and practice regarding disease prevention and control often involve conflicting rights and values. ➤ To recognize conflicts which arise in the context of disease prevention and control due to tension between individual and community interests or tension involving cultural beliefs and practices.

1730-1745

Break

Unit 5 | Ethical issues in Non-communicable health conditions

Session 9 1745 -1930	Ethical issues in Non communicable Diseases (NCDs)	E Premdas	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To recognize the foundational ‘Social determinants approach to NCD prevention’ ➤ To learn harm principle – how much can public health interfere in life style choices that do not affect or harm others? ➤ To learn multi-factorial causation and contextual analysis of public health issues ➤ To analyze govt policies and programs (at different levels) aimed at prevention of chronic diseases from public health ethics perspective ➤ Corporate entities <p>Case examples embedded in the presentation</p>
--------------------------------	--	-----------	---

END OF THE DAY 4, October 22, 2022

DAY 5 | Saturday, October 29, 2022

Unit 4&5: Cross cutting theme | Vaccination policy, ethics, law, and rights

Hours & Session no	Topic	Faculty	Learning Objectives
1530-1600	RECAP of Day 2 Responding to queries		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Two course participants to volunteer to recap ➤ Faculty to respond to any questions on the previous day
Session 10 1600-1730	Vaccination and ethics discourse	Anant Bhan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn about the concept of ‘public good’ and ‘common good’; and the concept of trust in the context of vaccination ➤ Case study (embedded in plenary presentation): Ethical issues in mandatory vaccination (conflict between legitimate values: individual liberty Vs public health; Conflict of Rights: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ right to individual autonomy Vs others’ right to health or right ➤ to not get infected; concept of free-riders)

1730-1745 **Break**

Unit 6 | Special themes: Part I

Session 11 1745-1930	Mental health as a public health matter: Law, Ethics and Policy	Kaustubh Joag	<p>Short Film Screening</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn public health aspects of mental health ➤ To identify relationship between mental health and key social determinants ➤ To learn relationship between mental health laws and policies from ethics perspective
--------------------------------	---	---------------	---

END OF THE DAY 5 | Saturday, October 29 2022

DAY 6 | SATURDAY, November 5, 2022

Unit 7 | Health and allied policies; and access to medicine:

A public health ethics and human rights perspective

<p>Session 12 1600-1730</p>	<p>Access to medicine: A human rights and public health ethics perspective</p>	<p>Confirmations awaited</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn the concepts of essential medicines and access to medicines from human rights and ethics perspective ➤ To recognize global drug imbalance ➤ To learn about government approaches to ensure people's access to medicine ➤ To identify govt and market failures ➤ To recognize access to medicines related obligations of corporates from the ethics and HR framework
<p>1730-1745 Break</p>			
<p>Session 13 1745-1930</p>	<p>Role of private players in health policy making: Resource allocation and conflict of interest</p>	<p>Amar Jesani</p>	<p>Short Film Screening</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn the concept of conflict of interest in the context of public health policies ➤ To learn and recognize various types of CoI ➤ To recognize the potential adverse impact of situations of CoI on public health <p>Case studies embedded in the presentations (May include: Food and Beverage industry, their role in health policy making: A case of Conflict of Interest Tobacco and alcohol industry and their participation in policy making (overt or covert)</p>

END OF THE DAY 6 | SATURDAY, November 5, 2022

DAY 7 | Saturday, November 12, 2012

Unit 6 | Special themes: Part II

Hours & Session no	Topic	Faculty	Learning Objectives
1530-1600	RECAP of Day 5 & 6 Responding to queries	Participants and all faculty to respond to questions	
Session 14 1600-1730	Panel on select special themes in public health	Srijit Mishra Subhasri Balakrishnan Moderated by one of the core faculty members	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Suicides amongst farmers as a public health concern: Connecting the dots and learning about ➤ Access to quality abortion: A public health perspective centre-staging ethics, justice, and rights (Subhasri or Sunita) <p>Two interactive presentations on two special themes in public health issues followed by 30 mins discussion</p>
1730-1745	BREAK		
Unit 8 Public health emergencies and ethical imperative of responding			
Session 15 1745-1930	Ethical principles that apply in health emergencies and epidemics	Tarun Bhatnagar	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn the concept of public health emergency and its specific characteristics ➤ To recognize application of public health ethics principles to such emergencies ➤ To learn the rights and obligations of front-line health workers in such situations ➤ Ethical issues in employing technology-based apps as part of the response to the PHEs
END OF THE DAY 7 SATURDAY, November 12, 2022			

DAY 8 | SATURDAY, November 19, 2022**Unit 9 | Environmental ethics**

Session 16 (a) 1600-1645	Occupational health	Jagdish Patel	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ To learn the concept of occupations health as a public health concern➤ Presenting the case study of silicosis➤ To learn legal and policy environment relating to occupation health building on the silicosis case study
Session 16 (b) 1645-1730	Nutrition, Public health, and social justice: A case of millets policies in India	Srijit Mishra	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ To appreciate the ethics and justice matters relating to role of nutrition in safe guarding public health➤ Insights and lessons from the case of reviving millets production, and consumption in India from a just public policy perspective
Session 17 1745-1930	Environment, health, and ethics: public health ethics as a bridge	James Dwyer	<ul style="list-style-type: none">➤ To describe ways that climate change has and will impact human health➤ To show how environmental changes raise issues of justice➤ To show how environmental changes raise issues of responsibility and responsiveness➤ To discuss how public health ethics can serve as a bridge between bioethics and environmental ethics

END OF THE DAY 8 | SATURDAY, November 19, 2022

DAY 9 | SATURDAY, November 26, 2022

- Small group work to discuss the public health problems chosen by the course participants on Day 1.
- Three to four groups will be formed comprising of course participants on Day 1.
- They will be working on their projects through the course duration to develop response to
- the problem at hand and make presentation in the plenary during the post lunch session on Day 9.

Session 18 1600-1700 through lunch hours	Public Health Professionals Committees meet to discuss the problems/case studies to develop the response	Course participants supported by all faculty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To learn to apply public health ethics principles and various related frameworks and laws to a public health problem ➤ To learn to deliberate in as a group to develop a well-reasoned out response to the problem at hand
---	--	--	---

1700-1715	Break		
------------------	-------	--	--

Project presentations

Session 19 1745-1900	Plenary for presentation by Public Health Professionals Committees the outcome of on their respective projects (three groups comprising course participants)	Course participants (three or four groups) Moderated by Faculty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ To defend the response/plan developed to respond to the problem at hand
--------------------------------	--	---	---

Session 20 1900-1930	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Open and Written Evaluation ➤ Valedictory ➤ Course certificate distribution 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ For course organizers to know the areas of improvement in the course content, learning methods, allocation of time and related matters.
--------------------------------	---	--	---

END OF THE DAY 9 | SATURDAY, November 26, 2022

AND COURSE CLOSURE